IMPLEMENTATION CHALLENGES AND LESSONS LEARNED: THE FISCAL SIDE

The Tsawwassen Experience

Tom McCarthy Chief Administrative Officer, TFN

TWO KEY THEMES Managing the Relationship Focus on fiscal relationships Realizing the Opportunity

OUTLINE - FISCAL RELATIONSHIPS

- Costs of Self-Government
- Fiscal Finance Agreements
 - One-time Funds, Implementation Fund
 - Annual Program and Service Transfers
- Fiscal Harmonization
- Own-Source Revenue
- Delegated Revenue Authority Structure
- Infrastructure Financing

COSTS OF SELF-GQVERNMENT

Self-government is more expensive

- Initial preparation and ongoing governance
- New institutions carry increased costs
- Required due to additional process and jurisdiction
- Scope of program jurisdiction includes:
 - Legislative and regulatory jurisdiction

- Policy development and design
- Decision-making
- Program delivery
- Administration
- Appeals and reviews
- Program evaluation
- 8 new elected positions
- Over 15 new appointme

FISCAL FINANCE AGREEMENTS

- Agreements setting out self-government financing structure:
- Principles of negotiation for fiscal finance agreements are set out in the Treaty
- Major issues:
 - Principle of comparability
 - Creation of on-going dependency relationship through insufficient funds
 - Application of own-source revenue
 - Implementation issues

ACTUAL 2013-2014 VS. FFA FUNDING 6

Program and Service Area	Approx. FFA Contribution (for year starting April 1, 2013 – Schedule A and D, non-time limited funding only)	Actual Annual Budget Amounts
Total	\$3,056,294	\$8,363,603
Health	\$366,262	\$843,265
Education	\$498,918.67	\$841,539
Social Service	\$535,405.24	\$892,304
Local Services	<u>\$1,155,329.49</u>	<u>\$5,007,025</u>
Physical Works	\$277,243.10	Current TFN reserve at \$1.28mn.
Fisheries	\$400,070.48	\$432,310
Local Government Liaison Services	\$100,000	\$347,160

FOCUS ON 'LOCAL GOVERNMENT' COSTS 7

Operation of TFN Government Institutions \$686,181	
Record-Keeping (incl. Enrolment Registry) \$150,465	
Consultation with Membership \$30,000	
Financial Management, Administration, Risk Management, \$1,087,4 Due Diligence, Accounting, Taxation	98
Land and Environmental Management \$1,465,3	77
Economic Development \$900,000)
Agreed-Upon Asset Maintenance\$497,845	i

FISCAL FINANCE AGREEMENTS (FFA/FTA) 8

One-time funds, Implementation Fund

- Interpretation challenges
- Eligibility challenges

Annual Program and Service Transfers

- Incompatibility, insufficiency
- Capital choice of application-based was perhaps misguided
 - Lack of access to other funds/programs
 - Capital TFN works through municipal streams

FFA RENEWAL ISSUE

• TFN working with Canada, BC on FFA renewal

- Difficult discussions
- Canada not substantively negotiating to the principles in the FFA agreement
 - Too restricted to 'mandates' to negotiate
 - Canada has only recently (last 5 years) recognized the challenges associated with multiple self-government agreements, each of which has a 'negotiation' commitment (see next slide)
- Comparability is critical
- Ultimately, OSR is more important, as other sources of revenue will dominate

FISCAL HARMONIZATION

- The federal government of Canada has made a proposal that would significantly alter the fiscal relationship between self-governing First Nations and Inuit communities and Canada;
- The department of Aboriginal Affairs and Northern Development Canada is proposing a Fiscal Harmonization Policy that would impose a formula based approach to work out how much financial support each self- governing First Nation would receive each year from Canada;
- At present, most, if not all, self-governing First Nations have specific sections in their Self- Government Agreements that force financial commitments to be resolved by way of "negotiation" between the signatories.
- Canada proposes an 'advisory panel' of First Nations under selfgovernment, to come together and advise on the formula process
 - Undermines any negotiating commitment, even if Canada indicates it will maintain commitments in existing relationships

Tsawwassen First Nation

OWN-SOURCE REVENUE

- Because Canada does not provide sufficient resources to implement self-government, First Nations must, once self-governing, be aggressive in their plans for revenue generation
- But this is hindered by the OSR formula, which kicks in right when the transition is beginning
 - OSR is a disincentive on each marginal dollar
 - There are options to reduce the negative impact
- No FN that TFN has spoken to is against the principle of self-sufficiency
 - The issue is with the forced application of the principle before the reality is achieved and the foundation is set

OWN-SOURCE REVENUE

Areas for improvement

- Appropriate fiscal financing is required before applying OSR
- OSR Complexity and Analysis
 - To our knowledge, AANDC does not have a team with the expertise required to effectively assess reports
- Maximum OSR Clawback needs reduction
- Consider alternate OSR structures, including the following:
 - Graduated OSR levels
 - Revenue targets before OSR is applied
- Broaden Exemptions and/or Provide Credits for "Good" Investments

DELEGATED REVENUE AUTHORITY

- Self-governing Nations all have full expenditure powers - over expensive programs and services
- But have no full autonomy constitutionally protected, legislative authority - over major revenue sources on lands owned by the First Nation
 - Property taxes, resource royalties, etc.
 - Some small exceptions re fees, licenses etc.
- By and large, revenue sources sufficient to fund the legal responsibilities are delegated
- Leads to an inequity legal responsibility for program delivery, but not for revenues to deliver those programs
 - Outcome: Remain tied to federal and provincial governments

INFRASTRUCTURE FINANCING

- Treaty First Nations are not eligible for financing for municipal infrastructure
 - Municipalities in BC work through Municipal Finance Authority
 - First Nations in BC work through First Nation Financing Authority
- Canada, BC, Institutions, First Nations need to come together on a solution
- Canada has indicated they want a treaty amendment to subjugate paramouncy of internal fiscal management
 - This is a non-starter fiscal management is core to a First Nation's self-government jurisdiction
- No treaty carve-out should be required there is another solution that contemplates a provincial backstop
 - For property tax, not other revenues